Lodewijk Muns

Classical Music
and the
Language Analogy

last revision: January 2015
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editorial Remarks</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Language, a Language, Language-Like?</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Beyond Metaphor</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 A ‘Universal Language’</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Imaginary Origins</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 The Sound of Speech</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 The Analogy: An Outline</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Mind and Grammar</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Defining Language</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 In- and Outside the Mind</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Language and Thought</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Functionalist Approaches in Linguistics</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 ‘I-music’ and Its Alternatives</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Generative Principle</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 One and Many</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Top-Down and Bottom-Up</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Analogy of Forms</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Shades of Sameness</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 Recursion, Unbounded</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Nature’s Love for Simplicity</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Lerdahl and Jackendoff’s ‘Generative Theory’</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 The Inner Work of Music</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Hierarchy</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Grouping</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Time-Span Reduction</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 The Schenkerian Component</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6 ‘A Deep Parallel between Music and Language’</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7 Cognitive Approaches since GTTM</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8 A Generative Grammar of Music?</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Musical Syntax</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Musical Grammar and Syntax</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Syntax</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 ‘Logic’ according to Koch and Forkel</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 Punctuation and Rhythm</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5 Phrase, Sentence and Period</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6 The Smallest Segment</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7 Parenthesis</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8 Harmonic Embedding</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6. The Unavoidable Commonplace 143
   6.1 Choosing One’s Words 143
      6.1.1 Phraseology and Grammar 144
   6.2 Musical Phraseology 147
   6.3 Rhetorical Concepts 150
   6.4 Musical ‘Topics’ 154
      6.4.1 ‘Types’ and ‘Styles’ 156
      6.4.2 Topics and Structure 158
      6.4.3 A Lexicon? 160
   6.5 Contrapuntal-Harmonic Schemas 161
      6.5.1 Learning by Exemplars 163
      6.5.2 Sequences and Cadences 167
      6.5.3 Schemas and Grammar 168

7. Anomalous Features: Quotation 175
   7.1 From Signal to Symbol 175
      7.1.1 Signs of Signs 177
      7.1.2 Proper Names, Pictures, Demonstrations 182
      7.1.3 Varieties of ‘Mention’ 187
   7.2 Replication, Reference and Embedding 193
      7.2.1 Musical Quotation as ‘Use’ and ‘Mention’ 195
      7.2.2 The Ineliminable Straw Man 202
      7.2.3 Musical Quotation Marks 206
      7.2.4 Repetition, Recurrence, Recall 209
      7.2.5 Musical Motto’s 220

8. Musical Discourse 227
   8.1 Beyond Grammar 227
   8.2 Rhetoric 229
      8.2.1 Orator and \textit{homo rhetoricus} 231
      8.2.2 Fine Arts and Liberal Arts 234
   8.3 Narrative 237
   8.4 Acts of Speech 240
   8.5 Being ‘About’ 243

Endnotes: Original Quotations 253
Bibliography 259
Abbreviations 259